

## 2. THE JUDGES

There are two panels of Judges. The Interstate Panel consists of one Judge from each Branch and is responsible for the Older Readers, Younger Readers, Early Childhood and Picture Book categories. The Eve Pownall Award for Information Books Panel (Eve Pownall Panel) is appointed by the National Executive from members of the Branch hosting the National Executive. The National Executive is located in Queensland for 2009 and 2010.

Incoming Judges provide information about themselves to the National Executive (usually via their Branch President) through the incoming Awards Coordinator. The Awards Coordinator forwards an electronic photo and information about each judge to the editor of *Reading Time*, welcomes the Judges and sends them a copy of the current Awards Handbook.

### 2.1 Eligibility for serving as a Judge

All Judges must be current individual members of a Branch of the Children's Book Council of Australia. Members of the Interstate Panel must be individual members of the Branch which they represent. All individual members of CBCA Branches are eligible to represent their Branches as an Awards Judge provided that they can show to the satisfaction of their Branch and, if necessary, the National Council that they will have no conflict of interest nor vested interest in the outcome of the awards during their term of office.

#### 2.1.1 Conflict of Interest

It is important for perceptions of fairness in the Awards that Judges have no conflict of interest in the outcome of the Awards during their term of office.

##### 2.1.1.1 Vested Interest

A person with a vested interest in the Awards may not be a Judge. For the purposes of these Awards a vested interest is taken to be any financial gain obtained from or other financial association with the actual publication process of a *current* entry in the Awards. Generally this would exclude publishers and their employees and may also exclude authors, illustrators, editors and others whose works would be entered in the awards during their term of office.

##### 2.1.1.2 Associations with an Entry

A Judge who has a non-financial association with a current entry or a financial association that is subsequent to the publication of a current entry (such as a paid review, a bookselling position or preparing readers' notes) is encouraged to declare that association to the other Judges and National Executive through the Awards Coordinator.

Should the National Executive consider a Judge's association with a current entry is sufficient to influence a public perception of bias in the judging of the Awards, they should ask the Judge to clarify his/her position and then decide to what extent the Judge should continue with judging related to that entry.

**2.1.2** No Judge may serve on both panels at the same time, but serving on one panel does not preclude a Judge from subsequently serving on the other panel.

**2.1.3** Potential Judges will be made aware of Judges' responsibilities and agree to fulfil these before accepting nomination for the position.



## **2.2 Appointment of Judges: Interstate Panel**

Each Branch will appoint a Judge for a two-year term using the criteria and procedural guidelines below. A person who has previously served as a Judge on the Interstate Panel for a two-year term or part thereof may be elected to this position again provided that a period of at least four years has elapsed.

**2.2.1** Selection of Judges should be based on the following criteria:

- recognised standing and qualifications in the field of children's literature
- wide and recent knowledge of children's literature, especially Australian children's literature
- awareness of illustration techniques, design, editing, printing and production processes.
- awareness of and commitment to the time required.

**2.2.2** Branches may select a Judge using a nomination process, or by calling for expressions of interest, or by using a combination of these procedures.

## **2.3 Appointment of Judges: Eve Pownall Panel**

The National Executive will choose Judges for the Eve Pownall Panel from suitably qualified people within the Branch which is hosting the National Executive.

**2.3.1** The panel should consist of at least three and not more than four people. It is desirable that at least one member has served as a Judge of the CBCA Book of the Year Awards.

## **2.4 Judges' Responsibilities: Interstate Panel**

The Judges will receive parcels of books from the National Office, sent at three weekly intervals. A list of contents will be included with each parcel and also sent separately by email. It is recommended that parcels contain no more than 25 books, from different categories wherever possible.

### **2.4.1 Reports**

Within three weeks of receipt of each parcel of books, each Judge will send to the Awards Coordinator a corresponding set of reports by email. Each report should include:

- a brief reasoned statement of the book's quality
- evaluation of the book into one of the following categories
  - No not Short List potential
  - Maybe undecided at this stage; possibly for consideration re Short List
  - Yes potential for Short List
- identification of Picture Books
- identification of Notable Books (See Section 4)
- Identify any titles not entered as EP that could be eligible for that Award.
- indication of the most appropriate category underlined or highlighted if this differs from the category nominated by the publisher.

**Note:**

**Judges should ensure that their evaluation takes into account the responses of children who have read the books.**



### 2.4.2 Teleconferences

Judges may be required to participate in teleconferences with the Awards Coordinator. These meetings could enable the discussion of any difficulties being experienced with the Awards process. The number and timing of these teleconferences will be determined by the Judges and the Awards Coordinator and organised by the Awards Coordinator or the National Office.

### 2.4.3 Files and Records

Judges should keep well-organised files of their own reports and copies of those of other Judges (which the Awards Coordinator will send them). They should become familiar with the range of opinions from other Judges, and the titles which some Judges consider notable and/or potential Short List material. Judges should have complete sets of reports on all entries in the four categories no later than four weeks prior to the Judges' Conference.

### 2.4.4 Annotations for *Notable Australian Children's Books*

The Awards Coordinator identifies books considered suitable for inclusion in *Notable Australian Children's Books 2111* (often called *Notables* for convenience) by a majority of Judges. Each Judge receives lists of titles to annotate from time to time and is asked to submit them to the Awards Coordinator as soon as possible so that work can proceed on preparing *Notables*.

### 2.4.5 Compiling Preliminary Short Lists

Three weeks prior to the Judges' Conference, Judges will list up to ten titles in each category which they consider potential Short List inclusions. These lists should be arranged in alphabetical order by author and sent to the Awards Coordinator for collation.

Within seven days of receiving these lists from the Judges, the Awards Coordinator will send a collated "long" list for each category. Judges consider these lists carefully and re-examine select entries in this light to prepare for the Judges' Conference.

### 2.4.6 The Judges' Conference: Interstate Panel

The Interstate Judges' Conference is usually held over four full days, including a weekend, five weeks after the Judges' Reports for the final parcel are due. The National President or a nominee of the National President will chair the Judges' Conference. The Awards Coordinator will perform secretarial duties. Decisions made at this conference are **strictly confidential**.

#### 2.4.6.1 Agenda and Tasks to be Accomplished

- (i) A Judge may seek discussion of written submissions, reviews or other relevant matters provided that these are circulated to each Judge and the Awards Coordinator at least two weeks before the Judges' Conference.
- (ii) Through discussion and voting procedures, the Judges select Short Lists, Honour Books and Winners in the Early Childhood, Younger Readers, Older Readers and Picture Book Categories. (**See Section 3 for detailed procedures**).
- (iii) Meeting with the Eve Pownall Panel, who give a general overview of the information books entered and discuss the Short List, Winner and Honour Books in this category.
- (iv) Editing as much as possible of the *Notables* for immediate publication.
- (v) Discussion of content and allocation of responsibilities for writing and editing the Judges' Report.



## 2.5 Judges' Responsibilities: Eve Pownall Panel

The Awards Coordinator and the Judges will arrange by negotiation a pattern of meetings and/or teleconferences through which books can be discussed. Some flexibility is necessary owing to the unpredictable number and date of receipt of entries in this category.

The National Office will distribute parcels of books, including a Contents List with each parcel, ensuring as regular a flow of books as possible.

### 2.5.1 Reports

All Judges will provide a report of each book by email to the Awards Coordinator for distribution. Each book report should include:

- a reasoned statement of the book's quality
- evaluation of the book into one of the following categories:

No	not Short List potential
Maybe	undecided at this stage; possibly for consideration re Short List
Yes	potential for Short List
- identification of Notable books, using the same abbreviations, (No, Maybe, Yes) as above (**See Section 4**)
- identification of books to be referred to the Interstate Panel of Judges for consideration in the Picture Book category

**Note:** In evaluating books, Judges may request the Awards Coordinator to consult **experts in special fields as necessary. Judges should ensure that their evaluation takes into account the responses of children who have read the books.**

### 2.5.2 Files and Records

Judges should keep well-organised files of their own reports and those of other Judges (which the Awards Coordinator will send them). They should become familiar with the range of opinions, especially regarding books which some Judges consider Notable and/or potential Short List material. Judges should have complete sets of reports on all entries in the Information Book category no later than two weeks prior to their Judges' Conference.

### 2.5.3 Annotations for *Notable Australian Children's Books*

The Awards Coordinator identifies books considered suitable for inclusion in *Notable Australian Children's Books 2011 (Notables)* by a majority of Judges. Each Judge receives lists of titles to annotate from time to time and is asked to submit them to the Awards Coordinator as soon as possible so that work can proceed on preparing *Notables*.

### 2.5.4 Compiling Preliminary Short List

Judges will compile a list of up to ten books which they consider potential Short List inclusions and send this to the Awards Coordinator no later than ten days before their conference. These will be collated as one "long list" and sent to Judges before the conference.

### 2.5.5 Judges' Conference: Eve Pownall Panel

This should take place one or two weeks before the Interstate Judges' Conference. It is advisable to set aside two days, though one may be adequate. Decisions made at this conference are **strictly confidential**.



### 2.5.5.1 Agenda and Tasks to be Accomplished

- (i) A Judge may seek discussion of written submissions, reviews or other relevant matters provided that these are circulated to each Judge and the Awards Coordinator at least two weeks before the Judges' Conference.
- (ii) Through discussion and voting procedures, the Judges select a Short List, Honour Books and Winner in the Eve Pownall Category. (**See Section 3 for detailed procedures**).
- (iii) Plan input for the meeting with the Interstate Panel, i.e. a display and general overview of the information books entered and details about the Short List.
- (iv) Edit entries for *Notables*, Information Books section.
- (v) Discussion of content and allocation of responsibilities for writing and editing the Eve Pownall Section of the Judges' Report and liaising with the Interstate Judging Panel to produce a unified report.

## 2.6 Participation in Announcing the Short Lists: All Judges

The list of Notable Australian Books will be posted on the web site by 9 am EST on the morning after the Interstate Judges' Conference. The Short Lists will be announced by the National Executive at noon EST on the same day. Both panels of Judges should be invited to this function.

## 2.7 Maintaining Confidentiality: All Judges

Throughout the judging process, Judges should not reveal information about how particular books are faring in Judges' reviews. Judges' reports are destroyed (not archived) after the Judges' conference (**See Sections 3.3 and 9**). The Awards Coordinator will obtain a signed statement from all participants (Judges, Awards Coordinators and chair person) declaring that all confidential material, both print and electronic, has been destroyed. This should occur after work on the Notables and Judges' report is completed. Proceedings at Judges Conferences are **strictly confidential**. Judges must not divulge information about their Long Lists, differences of opinion amongst Judges, how such differences were resolved, or how specific titles fared in the voting for the Short Lists, Winners and Honour books. After the official announcement of the Short Lists, Judges are encouraged to talk about the Short Lists and the Notable Books as much as possible, but never in ways which reveal the Winners and Honour Books until they are officially announced on the Friday before Children's Book Week.

## 2.8 Completion and Publication of Judges' Report: All Judges

This report must be approved by all Judges before publication. It is required for publication in *Reading Time* and also for distribution as embargoed information four weeks before Children's Book Week. Judges must therefore keep to the time line and procedures agreed upon at the Judges' Conferences.

The introductory section of the Judges' Report consists of general comments on all categories. The designated editor and representatives from both judging panels should liaise to ensure an effective synthesis.



The Awards Coordinator will ensure that the editor receives all sections of the report as soon as possible after the Judges' Conferences. When Judges receive a complete draft, they should return it together with corrections and suggestions within seven days. The Awards Coordinator should undertake a final proofread. The National Office arranges the printing and distribution of the Judges' Report. The final Report will be sent by the Awards Coordinator for the signature of each Judge to be appended. This signed copy will be sent by the Awards Coordinator to the Children's Book Council of Australia's National Archives.

## 2.9 Adherence to Deadlines

Judges should endeavour to have their reading done according to the schedule prepared by the Awards Coordinator. It is essential that the Judges strictly adhere to the following deadlines:

- reading and reporting on the books from each parcel within three weeks of receipt;
- circulating any documents to be tabled at the judges' conferences;
- writing and editing the **Judges' Report**;
- writing and editing *Notable Australian Children's Books*.

## 2.10 Resignation of Judges

If for some reason a Judge is unable to adhere to these guidelines, the Awards Coordinator should be notified immediately, with an explanation of whether the matter is temporary or permanent.

In the event of a Judge being unable to complete her/his term, that Judge must resign and the following will apply:

- all reports made by that Judge will stand and the Branch concerned shall have the right to nominate a replacement Judge, appointed to complete the term, provided this is done before 31 October;
- the resigning Judge shall turn over all entries to the replacement Judge;
- after 31 October in any year no Judge may be replaced;
- the replacement Judge will complete the term of the Judge s/he replaces.

